

Zeitschrift: Eclogae Geologicae Helvetiae
Herausgeber: Schweizerische Geologische Gesellschaft
Band: 64 (1971)
Heft: 2

Artikel: General solutions to the problem of radiogenic Argon-40 loss from metamorphic minerals : a comment
Autor: Wilson, Michael R.
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-163987>

Nutzungsbedingungen

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist die Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Zeitschriften und ist nicht verantwortlich für deren Inhalte. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern beziehungsweise den externen Rechteinhabern. [Siehe Rechtliche Hinweise.](#)

Conditions d'utilisation

L'ETH Library est le fournisseur des revues numérisées. Elle ne détient aucun droit d'auteur sur les revues et n'est pas responsable de leur contenu. En règle générale, les droits sont détenus par les éditeurs ou les détenteurs de droits externes. [Voir Informations légales.](#)

Terms of use

The ETH Library is the provider of the digitised journals. It does not own any copyrights to the journals and is not responsible for their content. The rights usually lie with the publishers or the external rights holders. [See Legal notice.](#)

Download PDF: 30.03.2025

ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, E-Periodica, <https://www.e-periodica.ch>

Graphical Solutions to the Problem of Radiogenic Argon-40 Loss from Metamorphic Minerals, a Comment

By MICHAEL R. WILSON

Laboratory for Isotope Geology, De Boelelaan 1085, Amsterdam 11

In a recent paper C. T. HARPER (1970) suggests a method of plotting potassium-argon data which might reduce the commonly observed discordance between potassium-argon dates from metamorphic micas and the true time of crystallisation as derived by other means. The method involves plotting argon-40 content against potassium-40 content. In an ideal closed-system case, samples of the same age but with different potassium contents will plot along a line (or isochron) which passes through the origin and whose slope is proportional to the age of the samples. If it is supposed that all samples, whatever their potassium content, have lost an identical volume of radiogenic argon then their analyses plot along a line parallel to the closed-system isochron, but with a negative intercept on the argon-40 ordinate. This intercept indicates the volume of argon-40 lost. Such is HARPER's graphical solution. It is questionable whether such a simple hypothesis could apply to natural rock systems since it does not take into account variations in argon retentivity caused by differences in grain size and chemical composition, but such is not the purpose of this communication.

HARPER seeks to gain support for his hypothesis by citing examples from the Scottish and Irish Caledonides and from the northern Appalachians. He admits that "the scatter of data is in some cases more than desirable", but suggests that "the results do illustrate the feasibility of using isochron-type plots for K^{40} - Ar^{40} data presentation".

Unfortunately the plots presented in Figures 6, 7 and 8 are far from convincing when the reference isochrons are removed from the diagrams. A single straight line can be drawn through, or close to, all the points in Figure 7, going through the origin. No criteria are proposed for selecting which biotites and muscovites in this figure should belong to which isochron.

Figure 5, on the other hand, is a very plausible plot, with whole-rock analyses of slates and phyllites lying on a 503 m.y. isochron with zero intercept, and analyses of micas lying on a parallel isochron with a negative intercept. Hypothesis proved? Not so. Figures 5 and 6 are both from the Scottish Caledonides. HARPER states unequivocally (p. 132) that the two groups of micas "appear indistinguishable on the basis of either stratigraphic, structural or geographic criteria". When all mica analyses in Figures 5 and 6 are plotted on one diagram (as can be done easily

using tracing paper) they form a single group of points, with sufficient scatter to make it quite uncertain as to whether the best fit line would have a positive or negative intercept. There is no suggestion from the distribution of points that the micas from Figure 5 should be plotted separately from those of Figure 6.

It would appear that the ten mica analyses in Figure 5 have been selected merely to fit the theory and for no geological or geochronological reason. Figure 5 must thus be rejected. The remaining data gives little support to the hypothesis.

REFERENCE

- HARPER, C. T. (1970): *Graphical Solutions to the Problem of Radiogenic Argon-40 Loss from Metamorphic Minerals*. *Eclogae geol. Helv.* 63/1, 119–140.